

San Carlos Apache Tribe / White Mountain Apache Tribe Transportation Partnership Steering Committee Notes

WEDNESDAY, July 27, 2016

9 a.m. – 3:30 p.m.

Sunrise Park Hotel

Greer, Arizona

MEETING PURPOSE:

- Update membership roster
- Review new partnership logo
- Update partnership goals
- Fill out Partnering Evaluation Program (PEP) forms
- Discuss dates for future meetings



ATTENDEES

Alfred Brooks, WMAT Public Works
Andre Stevens, WMAT Transit
Angelo Belvado, SCAT Transit
Bernadette Kniffin, SCAT Transit
Bill Harmon, ADOT
Charlene Mullis, ADOT
C.T. Revere, ADOT
Danny Shurter, Navajo county
David Francis, SCAT Transit
David Thompson, SCAT DOT
Dawnafe Whitesinger, Navajo County
Don Sneed, ADOT
Georgia Puente Meza, BIA – Fort Apache
Glenn Kephart, Navajo County Public Works
Kathy Borquez, Pinal County Public Works
Hugh Moses, SCAT DOT

ATTENDEES CONTINUED

Lynn Johnson, ADOT
Marvin Mull, SCAT DOT
Mary Tapija, SCAT DOT
Romare Truly, FHWA
Steve Aday, BIA – San Carlos Agency
Tara Chief, WMAT DOT
Travis Ashbaugh, Central Arizona Governments (CAG)
Wilbur Belvado, SCAT Transit

FACILITATORS:

Linda Ritter and Julia Voight

WELCOME

Linda Ritter welcomed everyone and introduced Julia Voight who will be assuming facilitator responsibilities for the partnership as a backup for Linda. Linda thanked SCAT DOT, WMAT DOT and SCAT Nnee Bich’o Nii Transit for providing lunch and refreshments for the meeting, and also thanked Tara Chief of WMAT DOT for working to secure the beautiful location for the meeting at Sunrise Park Resort. Dawnafe Whitesinger, representing Navajo County Board of Supervisors, gave the welcoming invocation. The participants then introduced themselves and stated what they hoped to accomplish by attending the meeting.

REVIEW OF PARTNERSHIP LOGO

- The new logo for review was designed from the April Steering Committee meeting discussion, with agreement to have desert graphics representing the San Carlos Apache Tribe landscapes on one side of the logo and mountain graphics representing the White Mountain Apache Tribe landscapes on the other side of the logo, with a road in the logo’s center representing the transportation partnership. Once the logo is approved, it was agreed that it will be incorporated into the Charter, which will be signed at the next Annual Meeting.
- Add more ground greenery and another pine tree on the right side of the logo to better represent the forest and greenery of the White Mountains
- Add a roadrunner on the left side to represent SCAT Transit
- The current logos representing all agencies are a strong statement. Include these logos or the agency names when displaying the new logo. Agency logos could potentially surround the new logo, be placed above or under the new logo, or if this is “too busy” visually, names of agencies could be designed under the new logo. We will review mockups of these graphic ideas at the next meeting and the logo will be finalized at that time.
- The SCAT Nnee Bich’o Nii Transit logo needs to be updated.
- Add the Navajo County seal

ISSUE ESCALATION LADDER

- Members would like to have the name “Issue Escalation Ladder” changed to “Issue Resolution Ladder” to represent how the ladder serves to work toward resolutions for a good partnership. The Partnering process in place at ADOT, which is used to guide this partnership, uses the name “Issue Escalation Ladder” to refer to the designated leadership levels that issues can be “escalated” to achieve resolution. Since the ladder’s name change will not be consistent with current practices used by ADOT for all partnerships, ADOT management will review this request for the ladder name change.
- Add a ladder column for each tribe for police.
- Add a ladder column for each tribe for BIA.
- Take out the “White Mountain” ladder column on the second page.
- The ladder will be continually reviewed by agencies for any needed updates, and the update information will be provided to Linda via email. The ladder will be presented for discussion at all Steering Committee meetings.

GOALS/ACTION STEPS REPORT

- The partnership goals are SMART goals - Specific, Measurable, Attainable, Results Oriented, and Time Oriented.
- It is important to revisit the existing goals and see how they were addressed and what kind of progress was made.
- It was agreed that we will continue to update and document the goals that have been achieved, and develop new goals once existing goals are achieved.
- The Goals/Action Steps report was reviewed and action items were added. The document is updated and posted on the AZ Tribal Transportation website:
<http://www.aztribaltransportation.org/sca/index.asp>

PARTNERING EVALUATION PROGRAM (PEP)

- Steering Committee members filled out PEP forms. The results will be reported at the next Steering Committee meeting, October 13, 2016.
- PEP serves to evaluate how well the partnership is progressing through members’ responses on the PEP form. It assists in determining areas needing improvement or areas in which the partnership is excelling. PEP is a numerically rated process, as well as an opportunity for members to provide comments about the partnership, regarding quality, communication, resolution, teamwork and relationships and schedule.

ANNUAL MEETING AND FUTURE STEERING COMMITTEE MEETINGS

It was determined to hold off the October 6, 2016 Annual Meeting until the following year- October 19, 2017. Action items still need to be completed before another Annual Meeting should be held. The

Goals/Action Steps report documents two years of efforts. The Annual Meeting in October 2015 discussed/reported what had been accomplished to that date, but there is not yet a good amount of completed action items to report this year. It is anticipated that key goals/action items will be completed over the next year. The achievements can be reported at the 2017 Annual Meeting and potential new goals/action items can be discussed at that time.

It was noted that one major accomplishment is WMAT joining the partnership.

- Leadership at the Annual Meeting includes tribal council, chief of police, county supervisors. Note that elections are in November
- Reporting at the Annual Meeting will be about two types of accomplishments - Project Delivery and Process Improvements. There was discussion of possibly providing a written report; whereby Linda would collect short write-ups from appropriate Steering Committee members to place into one report. More discussion is needed if Steering Committee members will have time in their schedules to provide write-ups. Previous Annual Meetings included verbal presentations or PowerPoint presentations by individual Steering Committee members.
- The Steering Committee will meet on October 13, 2016 and January 25, 2017 at Apache Gold Casino Conference Center. Additional Steering Committee meeting dates for 2017 will be determined at the October 13, 2016 meeting.
- Apache Gold Conference Center will be contacted by Linda regarding the October 6 meeting cancellation and to secure meeting space for the upcoming Steering Committee meetings and Annual Meeting.
- “Hold the Date” calendar announcements will be sent shortly regarding the October 6 Annual Meeting cancellation and the newly established Steering Committee and Annual Meeting dates and locations.

ROUNDTABLE – PARTNER UPDATES

SCAT DOT – Work on Route 6 is continuing to progress. Much has been achieved. The partnership has assisted with this effort. The jet fuel station (tribal project with FAA) is now completed. Fuel can now be sold to the various airplanes using the airport. The airport pavement project will start this month.

SCAT Transit – Excited to be progressing with more vans and wheel chair accessibility. In one to two years, it is anticipated that two smaller buses or coach buses will be ordered. There has been much progress since beginning in 2003, and transit is now self sufficient. It is exciting to be working with the White Mountain Apache Tribe to have future transit serving both tribes. There was an FTA audit (FTA technical assistance review) and response/work by staff was outstanding. The month of July kicked off much work by staff for safety, access planning. Bernadette Kniffin, Transit Services Director, expressed great appreciation for her excellent team.

Pinal County – October 6, 2016 is the Pinal County Town Hall in Eloy – it’s about transportation and the focus is on a regional transportation plan for Pinal County. If the voters approve a sales tax for the county, that will provide \$28 million for projects.

ADOT Southeast District – ADOT is administering a resurfacing project on BIA 6. It will be completed next month. There is a good slate of projects in design development, some of which are fully funded. These include the Bylas railroad crossing work this fall, as well as highway improvements in the spring with construction of a PHB (pedestrian hybrid beacon) in Bylas. Safety assessment in the casino airport area might be possible with

crash and incident data information. There will be a westbound climbing lane project near Peridot in Fiscal Year 2019. Turning lanes in Peridot may be constructed this year if funding becomes available.

ADOT Multimodal Planning –There are monthly transportation coordination meetings with WMAT DOT and ADOT MPD. This has allowed for both agencies to keep up to date and on track with activities and projects. Appreciation is expressed to WMAT DOT for sharing five years of crash data. WMAT DOT is anticipating using the state crash form to make sure the data is consistent with what goes into the state database. There is a full-day annual statewide transportation summit planned tentatively for February 7, 2017 at the ADOT HRDC facility in Phoenix. The tribal transportation website is being reviewed for updating. An Arizona Rural Transit Summit is planned for January 18-20 in Prescott at the Sheraton Resort. There will be a National Tribal Transportation Council in Sept 2017 in Tucson. Assistance from Arizona tribes and ADOT staff with that event is being encouraged.

FHWA –Funding availability was released in July and forms are due September 16. This is competitive funding and will be used for tribal safety plans. You can visit the FHWA site on August 3 for more information.

Central Arizona Governments – HSIP (Highway Safety Improvement Program) will be providing more funding. WMAT is a new member as of January and eligible for more funding.

WMAT DOT – There are three divisions within WMAT DOT: Transportation, Transit and Airport. Tara Chief, WMAT DOT Director, is working to get the Transit Division started and expressed gratitude to SCAT Transit Services for assisting with the WMAT transit services effort. Tara has also been working with the finance office to get budgets in place and staff on board for the DOT. In the Transportation Division, working with BIA, streets will be paved in White River with sidewalks, curb and gutter and other miscellaneous work. DOT will partner with BIA and Navajo County to improve a section of Route 12. WMAT DOT is also looking forward to partnering with Pinal County on needed projects. In partnership with ADOT, there is a 12-mile pavement preservation project in the design process, with a possibility of two pedestrian hybrid beacons. WMAT is now working to fill out ADOT forms regarding crash data and exploring training for future staff on the ADOT crash form process. With no other staff currently in place, Tara is looking forward to hiring DOT employees soon.

Navajo County – Work is under way to get an IGA with Gila County to work on the problematic area of Route 12. There is also an effort to bring back federal school funding. The last bill may have \$20 million for schools and tribal funding.

SCAT Public Works –Transit is a top priority and it is moving forward well. Public Works thanks everyone for working together. The emphasis with partnership is to get things done “because there is no ‘I’ in team.”

ADOT Communications – Keep in mind that ADOT Senior Community Relations Manager, C.T. Revere, is available to assist with any communication or public outreach needs regarding the partnership.

The Steering Committee meeting concluded with a benediction by Al Brooks.

NEXT MEETING

The next Steering Committee meeting will be held on October 13, 2016 at Apache Gold Casino. The October meeting agenda will include:

- Logo review and finalization
- Issue Escalation Ladder update

- Goals/Action items update including
 - There will be an update from SCAT Chief of Police, Alejandro Benally, regarding crash data.
 - Nate Nash, of the SCAT Planning Department, will provide a report on the development of the 911 system. Hugh Moses will contact Nate regarding providing the presentation.
- PEP results report
- Planning for future meetings

ACTION ITEM TO BE COMPLETED BY STEERING COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRIOR TO THE OCTOBER 13, 2016 MEETING

- Review the Issue Escalation Ladder for your agency and provide Linda with any updated information.

SUMMARY OF PARTICIPANT MEETING EVALUATION

Scores are based on 18 evaluations. Comments are taken from the evaluation forms exactly as written.

1. Rate how valuable this workshop is for you. 4.06 out of 5

What about this workshop was most valuable to you?

- The growing relationship between the two tribes.
- New transit goal between SCAT & WMAT
- I enjoyed participating in the meeting and found that the contacts you make by attending these meetings are invaluable. It is great to hear the progress made on program goals.
- Setting more tangible goals. Finding the correct contacts to accomplish each action.
- Follow-up on goal action items.
- Getting to know everyone.
- Face time with key agency reps.
- This was the first meeting in the WMAT land and is valuable in developing relationships with WMAT transportation.
- 911
- Sharing information with other agencies.
- Hearing everyone's ideas.
- Getting the updates and where we are at.
- Happy we added our "transit" goal. Transportation is not all about roads and bridges.
- Information that was discussed.
- The wealth of knowledge that the group has displayed.
- How ideas and thoughts were brought to attention.
- Networking and learning the goals of committee.
- Meeting new people. -Discussing the policy and procedures and who we talk to get answers.

2. What would have improved this workshop?

- Nothing.
- I do not have any suggestions for improvement.
- Greater representation from missing partners (example: ADOT GIS, BIA western).
- This was a good meeting. I have no suggestions for improvement.
- Nothing at the moment.

- Holding it outside in the mountain air. ☺
- N/A
- More solving goal, rather than adding.
- Nothing
- Move along faster.
- Not enough information for me to comment.
- N/A
- Doing well.

3. How do you rate the facilitator? 4.33 out of 5

- Linda is a great facilitator and is doing an outstanding job with the organization and implementation of the meetings.
- Good job at keeping meeting on schedule and ensuring greater accountability.
- Good job Linda!
- Stayed on task, which is always appreciated.
- Thanks for recognizing everybody and working on pronouncing Apache words.
- Linda is a welcome addition as facilitator to this partnership.
- Nice location.
- N/A
- Great presenter/facilitator.
- Everybody has room to improve.
- Great job keeping the meeting on task.
- Stays on topic and only moves forward once the group is ready.

4. How do you rate the speaker(s)? 4.08 out of 5

- Good attendee participation
- Always understood where the conversation was and is going.
- Not applicable today, but excellent discussion.
- Excellent, everyone informed.
- Great speaker, very clear and understands.
- N/A
- N/A
- None today.
- Everybody has room to improve.
- Needed a microphone and spotlight (more like attention to individual).

5. How do you rate the effectiveness of the team? 4.33 out of 5

- The team is highly effective at determining their needs and concerns. Progress has been made on their goals.
- Room for improvement to ensure that action items set by the group are met.
- Team is effective in providing guidance and in willingness to partner on priority issues/needs.
- Everyone seemed to be extremely cooperative.
- Outstanding potential dealing with difficult challenges.
- Very effective, a lot of discussion and everyone having inputs and willing to help.
- Good, continue working to resolve transportation issues for White Mountain Tribe.

- All that is here is all needed. Have many different views that we can all learn from.
- N/A
- Great – partner for the future.
- Everybody has room to improve.
- A lot of ideas brought forth.
- Effective in identifying steps to reach goals.

6. What other comments or suggestions do you have?

- I do not have any suggestions at this time.
- Thank you White Mountain Apache tribe for hosting and your hospitality today!
- Thanks!
- Excellent location for the meeting; got away from the desert heat.
- Just keep up the great work and ideas that will help each group.
- Time limit per goal.